



# CITY of NOVI CITY COUNCIL

[www.cityofnovi.org](http://www.cityofnovi.org)

Agenda Item 4  
July 23, 2007

**SUBJECT:** Approval to award a contract for General Contractor services for construction of an Indoor Gun Range at the Department of Public Works Field Services Complex to Garrison for a not to exceed fee of \$963,800.

**SUBMITTING DEPARTMENT:** Police *DEM*

**CITY MANAGER APPROVAL:** *PWA for CJP*

<b>EXPENDITURE REQUIRED</b>	<b>\$ 963,800.00</b>
<b>AMOUNT BUDGETED</b>	<b>\$ 1,725,300.00</b>
<b>APPROPRIATION REQUIRED</b>	<b>N/A</b>
<b>LINE ITEM NUMBER</b>	<b>266-266.00-976.000</b>

### BACKGROUND INFORMATION:

On September 12, 2005, City Council appropriated \$1 million of federal drug forfeiture funds towards the building of an indoor gun range. Wold Architects was selected to perform an indoor gun range and training facility assessment analysis.

The final Wold analysis included three options for building an indoor gun range. Of these three options, the one recommended and endorsed by the Police Department, was to build the indoor gun range at the Field Services Complex. Wold estimated the cost of this facility to be \$1,725,300.

Proposals were solicited for the architectural design and engineering of an indoor gun range. The proposals were evaluated using Qualifications Based Selection (QBS) criteria and numerically ranked by a cross-section of City staff. Using this process, Redstone Architects was recommended. City Council approved the selection of Redstone Architects.

Redstone presented preliminary designs to City Council. On March 28th, the Planning Commission approved a Special Land Use permit, the Preliminary Site Plan, and the Storm Water Management Plan. On June 1, 2007, final site and building plans were presented to the Community Development and Engineering Departments for appropriate reviews and approvals.

#### General Contractor Selection:

The City of Novi entered into an agreement with Plante & Moran CRESA, LLC – (the Real Estate group) to act as a consultant for pre-qualification and selection of the General Contractor for the indoor gun range. A RFP was developed and placed on MITN - BidNet. Twelve construction firms attended the mandatory pre-bid meeting. Six of the 12 firms submitted proposals which were evaluated by Plante & Moran using QBS criteria. The QBS criteria were developed by the Police Leadership Team and Plante & Moran. Three firms, Garrison Company, Reliance Building Company and Heritage, were deemed to have met the criteria.

On July 3, 2007, all fee proposals were opened at a meeting held in Council Chambers. This opening yielded the following results:

- |                              |             |
|------------------------------|-------------|
| 1. Garrison Company          | \$988,400   |
| 2. Reliance Building Company | \$1,077,000 |
| 3. Heritage                  | \$1,340,738 |

During the RFP process two bid alternates and a post bid alternative were listed for pricing options. Alternative #1 includes the removal of the brick veneer from the building, saving \$62,300. If this alternative is accepted, the Police Department would have to return to the Planning Commission for a waiver of the façade material requirements of the Zoning Ordinance. However, staff anticipates achieving some savings from the estimated project budget on the interior range equipment as described below. If these savings are achieved, all or most of the brick veneer will be added back to the project budget and it will not be necessary to return to the Planning Commission for the Section 9 waiver.

Alternative #2 is a Site Work Reduction. This includes the removal of the bio-swale and lawn-pavers from the fire lane located along the south side of the building for a savings of \$12,300.

Plante & Moran suggested the addition of Post Bid Alternative #1 to further reduce construction costs. This alternative would replace 9" inch re-enforced concrete with asphalt, saving \$24,600. By replacing concrete with asphalt, Garrison's price is reduced to \$963,800.

If a contract with the Garrison Company is approved by City Council, anticipate construction to begin on August 1<sup>st</sup> with completion and occupancy by December 30, 2007.

Interior Range Equipment:

A RFP for the interior range equipment components was developed and was posted on MITN - BidNet. All bids are due on July 27, 2007. It is anticipated that this contract approval will be presented to City Council for award on August 13, 2007.

The range equipment was initially estimated to cost approximately \$618,000. After identifying the specifications for the actual equipment that will need to be purchased, it is now anticipated that a savings of over \$100,000 may be realized. If these savings are achieved, the brick veneer (\$62,300) and the bio-swale (\$12,300) can be added back in to the project.

Project Budget:

Indoor Gun Range Cost Estimate		\$1,725,300
<b>Expenses to Date</b>		
Redstone Architects	\$158,153	\$1,567,147
Plante & Moran CRESA	\$14,600	\$1,552,547
<b>Projected Costs to Complete</b>		
Garrison Co. – General Contractor	\$963,800	\$588,747
Internal Range Equipment	Amount TBD – Bids Due 07/27/07	\$588,747

**RECOMMENDED ACTION:** Approval to award a contract for General Contractor services for construction of an Indoor Gun Range at the Department of Public Works Field Services Complex to Garrison for a not to exceed fee of \$963,800.

	1	2	Y	N
Mayor Landry				
Mayor Pro Tem Capello				
Council Member Gatt				
Council Member Margolis				

	1	2	Y	N
Council Member Mutch				
Council Member Nagy				
Council Member Paul				



www.novipolice.org

**NOVI POLICE  
DEPARTMENT**

**David E. Molloy**  
*Chief of Police*

**Thomas C. Lindberg**  
*Deputy Chief*

Administration  
(248) 347-0504  
(248) 347-0590 Fax

Communications  
(248) 347-0575  
(248) 347-0526 Fax  
(248) 348-7199 TDD

Investigations  
(248) 347-0530  
(248) 347-0570 Fax

Records  
(248) 347-0510  
(248) 347-0570 Fax

Uniform Patrol  
(248) 348-7100  
(248) 347-0526 Fax

45125 W. Ten Mile  
Novi, MI 48375  
(248) 348-7100  
(248) 347-0570 Fax

## MEMORANDUM

TO: Clay J. Pearson, City Manager

FROM: David E. Molloy, Chief of Police *DEM*

SUBJECT: **General Contractor Award – Indoor Gun Range**

DATE: July 16, 2007

Background:

On September 12, 2005, City Council appropriated \$1 million of federal drug forfeiture funds towards the building of an indoor gun range. In cooperation with Purchasing staff, a Request for Qualifications (RFQ) was developed for an indoor gun range and training facility assessment analysis and Wold Architects was selected to perform the analysis.

The final Wold analysis included three options for building an indoor gun range. Of these three options, the one recommended and endorsed by the Police Department, was to build the indoor gun range at the Field Services Complex. The Wold analysis estimated the cost of this facility to be \$1,725,300.

On December 4, 2006, City Council approved the solicitation of architects to submit proposals for the architectural design and engineering of an indoor gun range. On December 20, 2006, a Request for Proposal (RFP) was placed on Michigan Inter-governmental Trade Network (MITN) BidNet. As a result, 12 architectural firms attended a mandatory pre-bid meeting and site visit to the Field Services Complex on January 3, 2007. The proposals were evaluated using Qualifications Based Selection (QBS) criteria and numerically ranked by a cross-section of City staff. Using this process, two firms were deemed most qualified: Redstone Architects and CDPA Architects; with Redstone achieving the slightly higher ranking.

On February 5, 2007, City Council approved the City Attorney to enter into a contract with Redstone Architects. Redstone Architects presented preliminary schematic designs to City Council on March 19, 2007. On March 28th, the Planning Commission approved a Special Land Use permit, the Preliminary Site Plan, and the Storm Water Management Plan.

On June 1, 2007, final site and building plans were presented to the Community Development and Engineering Departments for appropriate reviews and approvals.



General Contractor Selection:

The City of Novi entered into an agreement with Plante & Moran CRESA, LLC – (the Real Estate group) on June 4, 2007 to act as a consultant and exclusively assist and advise the Police Leadership Team in the pre-qualification and selection of the General Contractor for the indoor gun range. A RFP was developed and placed on MITN - BidNet on June 12, 2007, with a mandatory pre-bid meeting to be held on June 18, 2007. Twelve construction firms attended the mandatory pre-bid meeting and all questions or concerns were addressed through Purchasing, Redstone Architects, Plante & Moran and the Police Leadership Team. Attendees were advised all sealed bids must be received no later than 3:00pm on June 29, 2007, at which time the proposals would be opened and read.

Six of the 12 firms submitted proposals and attended the June 29th bid opening. (Garrison Company, Reliance Building Company, Heritage, Summit, TES Consultants and Scheich Commercial Contracting) After the opening, the proposals were turned over to Plante & Moran for scoring and evaluation using QBS criteria. The QBS criteria was developed by the Police Leadership Team and Plante & Moran. Using this QBS, three firms were deemed qualified to construct an indoor gun range for the Novi Police Department. (Garrison Company, Reliance Building Company and Heritage).

On July 3, 2007, all fee proposals were opened at a meeting held in Council Chambers. This opening yielded the following results:

1. Garrison Company	\$988,400	
2. Reliance Building Company	\$1,077,000	
3. Heritage	\$1,340,738	
4. Summit	\$1,082,400	Not Considered Qualified
5. TES Consultants	\$1,211,710	Not Considered Qualified
6. Scheich Commerical Contracting	\$1,114,000	Not Considered Qualified

During the RFP process two bid alternates were listed for pricing options. Plante & Moran representatives also added a post bid alternative to the offerings. Alternative #1 includes the removal of the brick veneer from all four sides of the building, thus saving \$62,300. If this alternative is accepted, the Police Department would have to return to the Planning Commission for a waiver of the façade material requirements of Section 2520 of the Zoning Ordinance; commonly referred to as a Section 9 waiver.

Alternative #2 is a Site Work Reduction Alternative. This includes the removal of the bio-swale and the removal of the lawn-pavers from the emergency fire lane located along the south side of the building for a savings of \$12,300. Lawn-pavers will still be utilized in the parking spaces located on the west side of the building.

Consultants from Plante & Moran suggested the addition of Post Bid Alternative #1 as a means to further reduce the project's overall construction costs. This alternative consists of replacing 9" inch re-enforced concrete with asphalt (savings of \$24,600). The current plans call for the concrete surface to extend from the range to the asphalt parking lot of the Field Services Complex. Plante & Moran identified a possible issue with this transition of concrete to asphalt. They indicated this transition could deteriorate and result in a rough transition from the asphalt to the concrete surface. If the two surfaces are of the same composition, the transfer will remain consistent and smooth, as well as cost less. By replacing concrete with asphalt, the Garrison Company's price is reduced to \$963,800. The Plante & Moran analysis and cost comparisons are attached to this document.

Once approved by City Council, staff will work with the City Attorney's office to prepare a contract with the Garrison Company. We fully anticipate construction to begin on August 1<sup>st</sup> with completion and owner occupancy by December 30, 2007.

Interior Range Equipment:

A RFP for the interior range equipment components was developed and was posted on MITN - BidNet on July 13, 2007. All bids are due by 3:00 p.m. on July 27, 2007. It is anticipated that this contract approval will be presented to City Council for award on August 13, 2007.

The range equipment was initially estimated to cost approximately \$618,000 in the 2006 Assessment Study completed by Wold Architects. Through additional research and the RFP process, the range components were fully developed to suit the Department's training needs. After identifying the specifications for the actual equipment that will need to be purchased, it is now anticipated that a savings of over \$100,000 may be realized. If these savings are achieved, the brick veneer (\$62,300) and the bio-swale (\$12,300) can be added back in to the project.

Project Budget:

Indoor Gun Range Cost Estimate		\$1,725,300
<b>Expenses to Date</b>		
Redstone Architects	\$158,153	\$1,567,147
Plante & Moran CRESA	\$14,600	\$1,552,547
<b>Projected Costs to Complete</b>		
Garrison Co. – General Contractor	\$963,800	\$588,747
Internal Range Equipment	Amount TBD – Bids Due 07/27/07	\$588,747

Recommendation:

After carefully considering the proposals of the qualified General Contractors, it is my recommendation for the Novi City Council to authorize a contract with Garrison Company to construct an Indoor Gun Range at the Field Services Complex for \$963,800 as they received the highest ranking in the QBS process and were the lowest bidder.

July 12, 2007

Deputy Chief Thomas Lindberg  
Novi Police Department  
45175 West 10 Mile Road  
Novi, Michigan 48375

RE: GC Services – Novi Police Department Indoor Gun Range

Dear Deputy Chief Lindberg:

This letter transmits an update from Plante & Moran CRESA, LLC (P&MC) who has completed its engagement to assist and advise Novi Police Department (NPD) in its selection of a General Contractor (GC) for the Indoor Gun Range Facility project to be constructed adjacent to the DPW facility located at 26350 Delwal Drive. This update represents the mutual efforts of P&MC and the key staff from the Police Department to present a framework in order to identify, evaluate, and select a GC for the project.

P&MC was engaged by NPD and it was indicated that a Qualification Based Selection (QBS) process would be used to provide information relating to experience, bonding capacity, and an order of importance of the responding firms' experience to allow NPD to make an informed decision regarding hiring of a GC for the project in addition to the proposed cost.

The Request for Qualifications (RFQ), Request for Proposals (RFP), attachments, and an amended copy of the AIA Agreement with business terms, were submitted to NPD and its legal counsel for review and approved on Friday, June 8, 2007. On June 12, 2007, the RFQ/RFP was publicly advertised on the City of Novi's purchasing web site as well as sent to firms who expressed interest in the project.

On June 18, 2007, NPD in conjunction with P&MC, conducted a mandatory prequalification meeting at 2:00 p.m. EST in the City Council Chambers for the RFQ/RFP with potential general contracting firms as advertised.

On June 29, 2007, NPD received six (6) RFQ / RFP responses. Copies of the responses from these firms are available in the Clerk's office.

Deputy Chief Thomas Lindberg  
Novi Police Department

July 12, 2007

In evaluating the GC qualifications / proposals, P&MC considered firm qualifications as well as economic factors. Based on the experience as a GC, including police facility experience, bonding capacities, and proposed costs for services, three (3) firms meet the minimal requirements established by NPD. The attached spreadsheet provides a summary of qualifications, proposed fee, and other evaluation factors for each firm.

It is the opinion of P&MC that the City Council could engage the Garrison Company based on qualifications, proposed fee, and bonding capacity. Formal engagement should be contingent upon successful negotiation of an agreement between NPD and the Garrison Company.

P&MC is available to answer any questions about the study and the methodology used to prepare it.

Sincerely,

PLANTE & MORAN CRESA, LLC



Greg VanKirk



Paul R. Wills, AIA

Enclosures: (1) – GC Analysis

**NOVI POLICE - INDOOR GUN RANGE FACILITY  
GC RFQ ANALYSIS JULY 2, 2007**

Project: NOVI POLICE - INDOOR GUN RANGE GC ANALYSIS GC RFP Due Date: July 2, 2007						
(\$1,000,000 Building / Site Development Cost Estimate)						
	Garrison	Reliance Building Company	Heritage	Summit	TES Consultants	Scheich Commercial Contracting
Location of Firm	Farmington Hills, MI	Novi, MI	Clarkston, MI	Livonia, MI	Farmington Hills, MI	Troy, MI
Years in Business	53	35	5.5	10		8
Firm licensed in the State of Michigan	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		Yes
Self Perform Services	No	No	No	Yes		Yes
Staff Count (FTE)	20	7	2	10		3
Bonding Capacity (Single Project)	\$ 15,000,000	\$ 8,000,000	\$ 4,000,000	\$ 2,500,000		
Municipal Experience (% of Firm Work)	20%	100%	50%	40%		100%
<b>Municipal Experience - Type of Projects</b>	<b>Yes - 4</b>	<b>Yes - 12</b>	<b>Yes - 6</b>	<b>No</b>		
# of Police / Jail / Range	6	2	2	0		
# of Fire	0	0	0	0		
DPW / Transit Facility	2	0	4	0		
WWTP	1	7	0	0		
Other	0	3 - Post Office	0	0		
Current worth of Work in Process	\$ 15,000,000	\$ 2,000,000	\$ 5,400,000	\$ 2,000,000	\$ 80,000	
EMR Rating (Note: Less than 1.0 is excellent)	0.67	1.00	1.00	0.82		0.93
<b>RFP Information</b>						
Proposed Lump Sum	\$1,063,000	\$1,249,000	\$1,475,000	\$1,197,000	\$1,211,710	\$1,260,000
Alternate #1 - Brick Veneer	-\$62,300	-\$54,000	-\$75,000	-\$75,800		-\$80,000
Alternate #2 - Site Work Reduction	-\$12,300	-\$68,000	-\$59,262	-\$38,800		-\$66,000
Post Bid Alternate #1 - Concrete to Asphalt Reduction / Electrical Consideration	-\$24,600	-\$90,000	-\$18,000	-\$38,800		
Voluntary Alternates	\$0	-\$50,000	\$0	\$0		
<b>Total Estimated Direct Costs (with Alternate Consideration)</b>	<b>\$963,800</b>	<b>\$987,000</b>	<b>\$1,322,738</b>	<b>\$1,043,600</b>	<b>\$1,211,710</b>	<b>\$1,114,000</b>
<b>Proposed Completion Date</b>	<b>12/30/2007</b>	<b>12/14/2007</b>	<b>1/11/2008</b>			