

MEMORANDUM



TO: MEMBERS OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION

FROM: SARAH FLEMING, AICP
PLANNER

THROUGH: BARBARA MCBETH, AICP
COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

SUBJECT: TEXT AMENDMENTS 18.259—2505.14(c) AND 2505.14(e)
SCHEDULE OF OFF STREET PARKING STANDARDS

DATE: MAY 09, 2012

In an effort to better understand how the City of Novi off-street parking requirements compare to those of our peer communities, City of Novi Community Development Department planning staff have begun a review and comparison of Novi requirements and those in sixteen select peer communities throughout Oakland County, Wayne County, the State of Michigan and the greater US. Through this study, planning staff intends to identify any issues and/or discrepancies within the City of Novi ordinance as written and recommend modifications to said ordinance as required.

The first set of requirements reviewed in this study was for *Automotive Service Establishments, Public Garage*. The use is currently restricted to the following zoning districts: Freeway Service (FS), Light Industrial (I-1; subject to special land use when not abutting a residential district) and General Industrial (I-2). The definition of this use can be found in Table 2, attached to this memo.

In order to generate parking calculations for comparison, planning staff utilized an existing proposed site plan for this use which was recently submitted to the City of Novi Community Development Department. This plan proposed the expansion of an existing auto body collision shop providing body repair, frame straightening and auto body painting services. The specifications of this proposed project are as follows:

- Name: Collex Collision (SP-12-03); BRIVAR Construction Company
- Location: 25100 Novi Road
- Site Zoning: I-2 General Industrial
- Site Use: Auto Body Collision Repair
- Building Size: 27,956.5 sq. ft. (8,000 sq. ft. existing, 19,956.5 sq. ft. proposed)
- Employees: 20
- Service Bays: 33

Utilizing the off-street parking requirements outlined in the zoning ordinance of each municipality, calculations were run as if this project was proposed in each location. The attached spreadsheet outlines the outcome of these calculations, breaking out the following information for each community:

- Geographic location
- Land use classification
- Ordinance language

- Minimum total spaces required
- Average number of spaces required (over all municipalities; Novi not included in the average)

FINDINGS

After review and comparison each of the municipalities included in the study, staff has determined the following:

- 1) When compared to peer communities, the City of Novi requires the most off-street parking spaces for this land use. When tallied, the average requirement of all sixteen municipalities is 106 spaces. The City of Novi requires almost triple this average, with 300 spaces required for this project.
- 2) A similar use—*Gasoline Service Stations (Full Service)*—is provided in the off-street parking standards schedule under the “Business and Commercial” uses, but may be better represented in the “Industrial” uses. *Full Service Gasoline Service Station* uses are restricted to the same industrial zoning districts as Automotive Service Uses (FS, I-1 subject to SLU and I-2). Definition of the *Gasoline Service Stations (Full Service)* use can be found in Table 2, attached to this memo.

RECOMMENDATIONS

Planning staff recommends the following:

1) **Modify Parking Requirements for Automotive Service Establishment Uses**

Staff believes that the City of Novi ordinance as written requires more off-street parking than is necessary for the orderly and sensible operation of this this particular land use.

The City of Novi currently bases off-street parking calculations for Automotive Service Establishment uses on building square footage. In comparison, the majority of municipalities reviewed base their same calculations on the number of service bays at the location and the number of staff that will be on-site. Due to the nature of these types of businesses—highly space-intensive without necessarily generating large amounts of traffic—this second option may be a more equitable way to calculate off-street parking requirements for this particular land use.

In addition, the City of Novi requirements for the next most similar land use, *Gasoline Service Stations (Full Service)*, is also calculated using the service bays/staff method. Modifying the requirements as recommended would establish greater parity between these similar uses.

When considering this change, it is important for the Commission to note that the issue of excessive parking requirements for this land use has been raised in the past by auto repair shop owners whose businesses fall into this zoning classification, as is demonstrated by the following examples:

- On April 10, 2012, City of Novi Zoning Board of Appeals approved a request from Collex Collision (BRIVAR Construction Company) 25100 Novi Road (Case No. 12-011) to allow a reduction of required parking spaces from 300 to 140 spaces.

- On October 13, 2009 The City of Novi Zoning Board of Appeals approved a request from Wrencher’s Garage, 44455 Grand River Avenue (Case No. 09-041) to allow a reduction of required spaces from 68 to 20, with room for an additional 45 cars in a gravel lot.
- On May 8, 2007 the City of Novi Zoning Board of Appeals approved a request from Automotive Techniques, 40500 Grand River Avenue (case 07-029) to allow a reduction of required spaces from 54 to 16.

If not addressed, staff anticipates continued variance requests related to the parking requirements for this land use. For this reason, Staff proposes the following change to the City of Novi Zoning Ordinance, Section 2505—Off-Street Parking Requirements Schedule:

Section 2505.14(e)3	
Automotive Service Establishment, Public Garage	One (1) <u>Two (2)</u> spaces for every one hundred (100) square feet of usable floor area, <u>each service bay</u> , plus one (1) space for every employee. No wrecked or partially dismantled vehicles, or vehicles without current license plates shall be stored outside.

2) Reclassify Gasoline Service Stations (Full-Service) to fall under the heading of Industrial in the Section 2505 Parking Schedule

Reclassification of this use in the schedule of off street parking requirements could eliminate potential confusion by moving this use to the appropriate section.

Staff proposes the following changes to the City of Novi Zoning Ordinance, Section 2505—Off-Street Parking Requirements Schedule:

Section 2505.14(c)10	
Gasoline Service Stations (Full-Service)	Two (2) for each lubrication stall, rack or pit; and one (1) for each gasoline pump stand; and one (1) for each vehicle used as part of the equipment of the gasoline service station; and spaces for accessory uses.
Section 2505.14(e)5	
Gasoline Service Stations (Full-Service)	<u>Two (2) for each lubrication stall, rack or pit; and one (1) for each gasoline pump stand; and one (1) for each vehicle used as part of the equipment of the gasoline service station; and spaces for accessory uses.</u>

REQUESTED ACTION

Staff requests that Planning Commission set a Public Hearing for these proposed ordinance amendments on June 13, 2012, forwarding any recommendation to City Council for reading and adoption.

Should Commissioners have questions regarding this request, please contact Sarah Fleming, Planner, Community Development Department at (248) 735-5631, or via email at sfleming@cityofnovi.org.

TABLE 1: Article 25, Section 2505—Off-Street Parking Requirements for all Auto-Related Uses

USE	DEFINITION	ZONING CLASSIFICATION (as per 2505)	DISTRICT	OFF-STREET PARKING REQUIREMENT
Auto Wash (Automatic)	Not Defined	Business and Commercial	B-3	Two (2) plus one (1) for each employee plus one (1) for each vacuum station or similar area.
Auto Wash (Self-Service or Coin-Operated)	Not Defined	Business and Commercial	B-3	Two (2) plus one (1) for each employee plus one (1) for each vacuum station or similar area.
Gasoline Service Stations (Full-Service)*	See: Gasoline Service Station (Table 2)	Business and Commercial	FS; I-1 (SLU); I-2	Two (2) for each lubrication stall, rack or pit; and one (1) for each gasoline pump stand; and one (1) for each vehicle used as part of the equipment of the gasoline service station; and spaces for accessory uses.
Gasoline Filling Stations (Self-Service)	Not Specifically Defined	Business and Commercial	B-2 (SLU); B-3	One (1) fueling space for each fuel nozzle. In addition, one (1) space per 200 square feet usable floor area (not to include vehicle fueling spaces located at the pump) plus parking for accessory vehicle service uses. In no instance shall such a facility provide less than three (3) parking spaces. In no instance shall a required parking space or its maneuvering area conflict with vehicles being fueled or awaiting fuel.
Motor Vehicle Sales and Service Establishments	Not Specifically Defined	Business and Commercial	B-3	One (1) for each two hundred (200) square feet of usable floor area of sales room and one (1) for each one (1) auto service stall in the service room.
Oil Change Facility	Not Specifically Defined	Business and Commercial	B-3 (SLU)	Two and one-half (2.5) for each service bay.
Automotive Service Establishment, Public Garage*	Not Specifically Defined	Industrial	FS, I-1 (SLU, not abutting R); I-2	One (1) space for every one hundred (100) square feet of usable floor area, plus one (1) space for every employee. No wrecked or partially dismantled vehicles, or vehicles without current license plates shall be stored outside.

* Establishments which are permitted to provide automotive repair services

TABLE 2: Article 2, Section 201—Definitions

USE	DEFINITION
Automobile Repair	The general repair, engine rebuilding, rebuilding or reconditioning of motor vehicles; collision service, such as body, frame, or fender straightening and repair; overall painting and undercoating of automobiles.
Garage, Service	Any premises used for the storage or care of motor-driven vehicles, or where any such vehicles are equipped for operation, repaired, or kept for remuneration, hire or sale.
Gasoline Service Station	A place for the retail dispensing, sale, or offering for sale of motor fuels, with the only permitted accessory uses being the servicing and minor repair of motor vehicles; retail sales of minor automotive related convenience products and accessories such as windshield washer fluid, motor oil, wipers and window scrapers; and retail sales of non-automotive related products, including (i) sundries such as gum, candy, cigarettes, newspapers, magazines, and other individually packaged convenience items; (ii) basic convenience grocery items, such as milk and bread; (iii) pre-prepared food items that are not subject to licensing by the Michigan Department of Agriculture or the Oakland County Health Department; and (iv) non-alcoholic beverages.

Off-Street Parking Requirements: Various Municipalities
USE: Automotive Service Establishment, Public Garage

Location	Municipality	Land Use	Ordinance Language	Minimum Total Spaces Required (rounded)
Oakland County, MI	Novi	INDUSTRIAL <i>Automotive Service Establishment, Public Garage</i>	One (1) space for every one hundred (100) square feet of usable floor area, plus one (1) space for every employee. No wrecked or partially dismantled vehicles, or vehicles without current license plates shall be stored outside.	300
	Farmington Hills	BUSINESS AND COMMERCIAL <i>Auto Repair</i>	Three (3) for each service stall.	99
	Troy	COMMERCIAL <i>Vehicle Repair Station</i>	Two (2) spaces for each service bay, plus one space for each tow truck if applicable, plus adequate spaces for overnight parking, plus one (1) space per one (1) employee on the largest typical shift.	86
	Birmingham	COMMERCIAL <i>Motor Vehicle Sales and Service Establishment</i>	One (1) space for each three hundred (300) square feet of floor area of sales room plus one (1) space for each auto service stall, not to be used for new or used car storage.	126
	Rochester Hills	COMMERCIAL <i>Retail Sales and Service Establishments</i>	One (1) space per three hundred (300) square feet of floor area.	93
	Wixom	COMMERCIAL <i>Minor Automotive Repair</i>	Two (2) spaces per each service bay, plus one (1) space per employee, plus one (1) space per each tow truck.	86
	West Bloomfield Township	INDUSTRIAL <i>Automotive Repair and Service Establishment, Public Garage</i>	Two (2) for each one (1) auto service stall or one (1) auto body stall plus one (1) space for every employee.	86
	Commerce Township	COMMERCIAL <i>Automobile Vehicle Service Center/ Repair Station</i>	One (1) per on-duty employee based on maximum employment shift, plus one (1) per service bay, plus one stacking space per service bay.	86
	City of Northville	BUSINESS AND COMMERCIAL <i>Automobile Service Stations</i>	Two (2) for each service bay; and one (1) for each gasoline pump in addition of the requirements of an auto wash and convenience store as provided herein. Auto Wash (Automatic): One (1) for each one (1) employee. In addition, reserve parking spaces equal in number to five (5) times the maximum capacity of the auto wash. Maximum capacity of the auto wash shall mean the greatest number of automobiles possible undergoing some phase of washing at the same time, which shall be determined by dividing the length in feet of each wash line by twenty (20). Auto Wash (Self-Service or Coin Operated): Five (5) for each washing stall in addition to the stall itself. Convenience Store, with or without gasoline service : Four (4) spaces per one thousand (1,000) square feet of usable floor area, plus spaces required for an auto service station activities or gasoline sales.	198

Off-Street Parking Requirements: Various Municipalities
USE: Automotive Service Establishment, Public Garage

Location	Municipality	Land Use	Ordinance Language	Minimum Total Spaces Required (rounded)
Wayne County, MI	Northville Township	BUSINESS AND COMMERCIAL <i>Automobile Service Stations and Automobile Maintenance and Repair Establishments</i>	One (1) space per pump, plus two (2) exterior spaces per service bay, plus one (1) space per employee at peak shift, plus one (1) space per tow truck, plus one (1) space per five hundred (500) square feet devoted to the sale of automotive goods or convenience store retail area, plus spaces required for any accessory uses.	86
	Canton Township	BUSINESS AND COMMERCIAL <i>Auto and Vehicle Repair or Service Facilities, Bump Shops</i>	One (1) space per employee plus two (2) spaces per service or repair bay, plus one (1) space per eight hundred (800) square feet of usable floor area.	121
State of Michigan	Ann Arbor (Washtenaw County)	COMMERCIAL <i>Gasoline Service Stations, Auto Repair and Service</i>	One (1) space per two hundred (200) square feet of floor area plus one (1) bicycle space.	141
	Grand Rapids (Kent County)	COMMERCIAL <i>Vehicle Service, Repair Facility; Vehicle Towing, Storage</i>	Three (3) per stall plus one (1) per employee.	119
Other States	Greenville, NC	INDUSTRY <i>Auto, Truck or Boat Repair</i>	One (1) space per two (2) employees, plus three (3) storage spaces for each repair stall (the repair stalls may count as spaces).	76
	Naperville, IL	RETAIL AND WHOLESALE TRADE <i>Automobile Service Station and Repair Facility</i>	4.5 parking spaces per each 1,000 square feet of gross floor area.	126
	North Richland Hills, TX	AUTOMOTIVE <i>Auto Repair, Garage Shop</i>	One (1) space for every five hundred (500) square feet of floor, minimum of five (5) spaces.	56
Average number of spaces required by the above municipalities (average does not include Novi):				106

Development Specifications:

Bldg Sq. Ft.	27,956.50
Repair Stalls	33
Staff	20